Via electronic delivery

His excellency Mr President
Cyril Ramaphosa
President of the Republic of South Africa
presidentrsa@presidency.gov.za

Honourable Minister Mantashe
Minister of Mineral Resources
minister@dmre.co.za; Vuyelwa.Siyeka@dmre.gov.za; George.Lekorotsoana@dmre.gov.za

Honourable Minister Creecy
Minister of Forestry Fishery and the Environment
minister@environment.gov.za; fshaik@environment.gov.za; nleontsinis@environment.gov.za

CEO South African National Biodiversity Institute (SANBI)
Mr Shonisani Munzhedzi
Ceo@sanbi.org.za

CEO Shell
Mr Ben Van Beurden
mailto:ben.vanbeurden@shell.com

@GretaThumberg
@LeoDiCaprio
@ExtinctionR
@XrYouth

URGENT

26 November 2021

His Excellency, Honourable Ministers and Chairs,

NATIONAL AND INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATIONS URGE THE SOUTH AFRICAN GOVERNMENT TO DESIST FROM THE CURRENT SEISMIC SURVEY ACTIVITIES TO ALLOW FOR FURTHER URGENT SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH

The Wildlife Animal Protection Forum South Africa (WAPFSA), an alliance of diverse South African NGOs that share certain values, knowledge and objectives and that collectively comprise a body of expertise from scientific, conservation, welfare, rights, tourism, social justice, indigenous rights, public advocacy sectors and the law.
The undersigned national and international organisations refer to the proposed seismic exploration activity by Shell and Shearwater GeoServices that is due to begin on or around the 1st of December 2021 and fully support the actions and campaign from the collation called Oceans Not Oil.

The undersigned members are opposed to the proposed exploration activities due to a host of reasons which are outlined below:

In 2013, Impact Africa Limited applied for an Exploration Rights in terms of Section 79 of the Mineral and Petroleum Resources Development Act (MPRDA) to explore for oil and gas in the Transkei and Algoa Exploration Areas off the East Coast of South Africa. An Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) report was, at that stage, not a requirement in the application process and an Environmental Management Plan (EMP) was drawn up instead. In the eight years since the exploration rights were applied for, legislation has changed and it is now mandatory that an EIA is carried out for projects of this nature. It is vitally important that a high level of research and study be undertaken before such a large scale seismic survey can be permitted. Various assessments need to be conducted by scientists to determine the effects of the proposed project before it can be allowed to commence.

There are five Marine Protected Areas (MPAs) that fall within the proposed exploration site of the project. The EMP states that no seismic activity will take place in the MPAs, nor within a 2km buffer zone around these MPAs.

WAPFSA members strongly believe that insufficient research has been undertaken to fully understand and prepare for the negative effects of the seismic activity on the ecosystems in the area and on the aquatic life within them. What scientific study has been carried out in order to suggest that a 2km zone will offer sufficient protection from the seismic activity? A 2km buffer zone cannot offer protection against the acoustic waves which travel tens to hundreds of kilometres from the blast site.

Marine mammals are extremely dependent on sound in order to communicate and navigate. It is common knowledge that cetaceans such as whales and dolphins are sensitive to seismic testing and have been linked to beaching or stranding.

The EMP reports that the seismic exploration blasting will begin slowly, increasing gradually, in an attempt to allow animals in the area to move away. The proposed blasting will be active continuously throughout the survey period of four to five months.

Smaller animals who are unable to move out of the area will be subjected to non-stop blasting, which can have life threatening, detrimental effects on them. The larger animals who may move from the area due to the blasting will be forced to leave their respective ecosystems and protected areas, putting them at unnecessary risk.

Intense noise, from seismic blasting, has been shown to cause body malformations and delay of development in marine larvae, as well as eliciting endocrinological stress in many fish. Potential biological effects of air seismic gun noise includes physical/physiological effects, behavioral disruption, and indirect effects associated with altered prey availability. Physical/physiological effects could include hearing threshold shifts and auditory damage and masking of communication signals (e.g. cetaceans) as well as non-auditory disruption, (e.g. feeding decline) and can be directly caused by sound exposure or the result of behavioral changes (including habitat displacement) in response to sounds, (e.g. recent observations suggesting that exposure to loud noise may result in decompression sickness).

There is insufficient research-based evidence to confirm the impacts of the seismic activity, negative or other, on fish who are confined to fish farms in the Algoa Bay area.
Marine species who are scared away from the MPAs due to the seismic activity will leave said MPAs and enter unprotected waters where they risk being fished, hunted and poached. The very purpose of the MPAs will then be made null and void by the impacts of the seismic exploration.

Migration routes of numerous species, which have been passed down and utilised through generations will be altered due to the seismic activity. The migration patterns of about 130,000 whales from East Africa towards the West Coast where they breed and nurse their young is directly intercepted by the exploration area.

WAPFSA members feel that not enough research has been conducted on the knock-on effects of the disturbance of the migration routes. These include the important migration routes of whales and the endangered loggerhead turtle.

While mitigation measures included in the management plan is to attempt to avoid blasting during migration seasons for larger whale species such as southern right and humpback whales, semi-migratory and other species will still be within the survey area during the blasting period and will be affected by the noise.

These include beaked whales, Bryde’s whales and sperm whales. A beaked whale species called True’s has never been seen alive at sea, with not much being known about their behaviour, distribution and abundance. There are other species of turtles, squid and fish for whom the same can be said, and so the effects of the seismic activity on these species cannot be known or adequately prepared for. It is of concern that deep diving beaked whales may surface too quickly and die from barotrauma as a result of the blasting. Bowhead whales have been shown to change their surface respiration and cease their calls.

Tissue damage has been recorded, especially in mammals but in other, smaller animals as well. Temporary and permanent hearing loss has been observed and whale calves have been separated from their mothers due to the noise levels. Foraging and nursing could be affected. Behavioural changes could involve changes in time spent at the water’s surface, dive times and energy costs due to having to travel greater distances in an attempt to evade the sound. The stress that is caused by the seismic blasts can change body physiology, affecting growth and reproduction and can even result in death. Fish also depend on sound for communicating with group members and young, food-finding, reproduction, avoiding predators and hazards, navigation and sensing their environment. Without any baseline surveys having been done to determine the effects of the airgun blasting on marine life in the area, we can rely only on the limited information available and this information paints a bleak picture for the aquatic animals along our coast.

The incredible biodiversity found along our coast should be protected, not exposed to danger and/or chased away. Within the five MPAs that fall within the exploration area, there is a vast spectrum of biodiversity. Underwater features, ecological transition zones, fish and cetacean species ranging from critically endangered to vulnerable, including endemic species such as the red steenbras. There are major concerns on the effects of seismic blasting on corals, turtles, dolphins or whales; some devastating effects on the ocean’s zooplankton have recently been documented. Other species of great concern are the numerous turtle species found along the South African coast, Cape Fur Seals, African Penguins and Black Oystercatcher.

Algoa Bay was declared the Bottlenose Dolphin Capital of the World in 2016, hosts the Addo Marine Protected Area and is home to various vulnerable and endangered species, including 43% of the global population of the African penguin which is classified as Endangered in the Red IUCN list. The area is also a significant breeding population of Cape cormorant and Bird Island is one of only six breeding sites in the world for the Cape gannet and is home to Cape fur seals and albatrosses.

There is an active boat-based whale and dolphin watching industry in Algoa Bay which, together with the scuba diving eco-tours, can offer close-up encounters with the unique wildlife in the bay and can ultimately offer potentially long term and regenerative jobs.

Mitigation measures state that no airguns are to be set off if there are large or small cetaceans, diving seabirds or turtles within a 500m range for a period of at 30 minutes prior to firing. In the same point, it is stated that if
small cetaceans are still within 500m of the airguns after 30 minutes, the normal soft start procedure will be allowed to commence for at least a 20 minute duration. How does a method that is in direct contradiction with the previous statement serve as compliance?

Mass disorientation or stunning of fish as a result of seismic survey activities has been observed. This indicates that effects on fish populations in the area are expected. These effects will no doubt have knock on effects throughout the ecosystems and these have not been adequately examined and mitigated for. Small fish mortality associated with airgun operation and unusual bird sightings are also listed as impacts to be noted, showing once again that these negative effects on the fauna of the area are expected.

In terms of monitoring impacts to assist with any possible compensation negotiations, the compliance audit states that noise levels during the survey will be monitored in areas within 25km of the Marine Protected Areas. Why is it that noise levels within 25km are being monitored when seismic activity is allowed to take place a mere 2km away from the MPAs? This implies that larger impacts are expected.

If resources are found, the following offshore drilling will potentially produce petroleum along with a host of other environmentally harmful substances including arsenic, nickel, copper, chromium, zinc and barium. Heavy metals and hydrocarbons can be devastating for the health of marine organisms and to the people who live and feed off the coast. Another major environmental concern is linked to the disposal of highly toxic production waste caused by the hydrocarbon drilling. Oil spills can quickly traverse vast distances. The Benguela current is one of the strongest and most dangerous in the world, which can have devastating effects in the case of an oil spill. These types of devastation will also destroy livelihoods to over 50 000 subsistence fisher folk who eke out a living daily. Even small occasional spills will impact local communities and increase poverty and lead to more people joining the unemployment line. The risk of an oil spill polluting our beaches is also of grave concern, which would have far reaching consequences on the ecosystems and aquatic life along our coastline.

The decline in sea bird populations, the destruction of fish eggs and larvae, the immune system suppression in organisms, the destruction of delicate seabeds, the temporary or permanent hearing loss in fish and mammals, the abandonment of habitats, the disruption of mating and feeding, disorientation, stranding or beaching and death of many species are of grave concern to us. For whales and dolphins, who rely on their hearing to find food, communicate and reproduce, being able to hear is a life-or-death matter. These blasts have shown to cause massive mortality and destruction in zooplankton, which is the basis of all marine food chains. This would also result in increased economic challenges.

With regards to the health of the communities who rely on a healthy oceanic system to make out their living, the following health impacts have been found: itchy eyes, watery eyes, nosebleeds, wheezing, sneezing, and coughing are all symptoms of exposure to crude oil. Chest pain, respiratory problems, dizziness, gastrointestinal problems are also common ailments. A study of clean-up workers from the 2002 Prestige oil spill in Spain found increased DNA damage, especially among those who worked along beaches. Such genetic changes can lead to cancer. Mental health increases in symptoms of post-traumatic stress, generalized anxiety disorder and of depression.

These activities will affect all the coastal communities and businesses and the economies and the health of residents; we find unacceptable that further investments are directed towards fossil fuels and activities which are harmful for present and future generations in view of the recent climate change agreements during COP26 in Glasgow.

The conclusion of the compliance audit is as follows, “The compliance audit against the EMPr was largely not applicable, since no activities in respect of the Transkei Algoa Exploration Right have commenced at the time of reporting. Additionally, the EMPr contains management and mitigation measures in line with current legislative requirements and industry standards.” There is simply not enough research or experience on the
short and long term effects of the seismic exploration on the marine ecosystems, nor on the fauna found within them, to allow for these activities to proceed in good conscience.

WAPFSA members and the undersigned organisations hereby urge the South African government to desist from the current seismic surveys activities, to allow for further urgent scientific research. Further research must also be carried out whereby the negative long-term effects for the South African tourism industry, the livelihoods of South Africans and health of South Africans living in this coastal region can be established.

South Africa should be looking to attract foreign investment in alternative eco-energy sources.

Yours sincerely,

stefania falcon
WAPFSA Coordinator
stefania@wapfsa.org
Mobile: +27 (0)73 3012107
http://wapfsa.org/

FOR URGENT MEDIA DIFFUSION

SIGNED BY THE FOLLOWING WAPFSA MEMBERS:

African Climate Alliance         Climate Dep         Sairusha Govindsamy
Animal Talk Africa              Founder           Wynter Worsthorne
Baboon Matters                  Founder           Jenni Trethowan
Baboons of the South            Founder           Lorraine Holloway
Ban Animal Trading              Director           Smaragda Louw
Beauty Without Cruelty (South Africa) Chairperson     Toni Brockhoven
Betty’s Bay Baboon Action Group Co- Founders       Renee Bish and Peter Oxford
Centre for Animal Rehabilitation and Education Director     Stephen Munro
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organisation</th>
<th>Role</th>
<th>Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Elephant Reintegration Trust</td>
<td>Chairperson</td>
<td>Brett Mitchell</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMS Foundation</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>Michele Pickover</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Four Paws (SA)</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>Fiona Miles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Future 4 Wildlife</td>
<td>Co-Founder</td>
<td>Stefania Falcon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gifted for Good</td>
<td>Env. Education</td>
<td>Jabu Myeni</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global White Lion Protection Trust</td>
<td>CEO Founder</td>
<td>Linda Tucker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institute for Critical Animal Studies (Africa)</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>Les Mitchell</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monkey Helpline</td>
<td>Co-Founder</td>
<td>Steve Smit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OSCAP-Outraged SAfrican Citizens Against Poaching</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>Kim Da Ribeira</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parliament for the People</td>
<td>Reg Farming</td>
<td>Vivien Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rhinos in Africa</td>
<td>Founder</td>
<td>Megan Carr</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAIFAC SA Institute for Advanced Constitutional Law</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>Professor David Bilchitz</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Peninsula Khoi Council</td>
<td>Senior Chief</td>
<td>Stephen Fritz</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southern African Fight for Rhinos</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>Lex Abnett</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vervet Monkey Foundation</td>
<td>Founder</td>
<td>Dave Du Toit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WildAid Southern Africa</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>Guy Jenning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youth Climate Group</td>
<td>Climate Justice</td>
<td>Sera Farista</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**SUPPORTED BY THE FOLLOWING NATIONAL AND INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATIONS:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organisation</th>
<th>Role</th>
<th>Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pro Wildlife</td>
<td>Chair of the Board</td>
<td>Andrea Hoepnner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fondation Franz Weber - Switzerland</td>
<td>President/CEO</td>
<td>Vera Weber, President &amp; CEO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global Law Alliance for Animals and the Environment</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>Erica Lyman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Born Free Foundation - UK</td>
<td>Veterinarian</td>
<td>Dr Mark Jones</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CATCA Environmental and Wildlife Society (CEWS)</td>
<td>CEO</td>
<td>Ericka Ceballos</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Marine Mammal Project of Earth Island</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>Mark J. Palmer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brazilian Nature Conservation Institute - IBRACON</td>
<td>President</td>
<td>Nalu Machado</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Augusto Carneiro Institute</td>
<td>President</td>
<td>Kathia Vasconcellos Monteiro, Jr.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Divers for Sharks</td>
<td>Co-founder</td>
<td>José Truda Palazzo, Jr.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brazilian Humpback Whale Institute</td>
<td>President</td>
<td>Eduardo Camargo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marine Mammal Conservation of Mexico COMARINO</td>
<td>Founder</td>
<td>Dr Yolanda Alaniz</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global Law Alliance for Animals and the Environment</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>Nicholas Fromherz</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senior Attorney - Latin America</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
REFERENCES


Wir 2008. Overt responses of Humpback whales (Megaptera novaeangliae), Sper whales (Physeter macrocephalus), and Atlantic spotted dolphins (Stenella frontalis) to seismic exploration off Angola. Aquatic Mammals 34(1):71-83. DOI 10.1578/AM.34.1.2008.71


President Cyril Ramaphosa: Virtual UNGA75 Summit on Biodiversity | South African Government (www.gov.za)


1https://www.bing.com/search?q=was+declared+a+Hope+Spot+by+Dr+Sylvia+Earle+in+2014%2C+declared+the+Bottlenose+Dolphin+Capital+of+the+World+in+2016&aqs=edge..69i57&FORM=ANCMS9&PC=ACTS

Algoa Bay: Bottlenose Dolphin Capital of the World! - World Cetacean Alliance

Addo Elephant National Park — Marine Protected Areas South Africa


Algoa Bay Islands - Addo Elephant National Park - BirdLife South Africa

Algoa Bay Hope Spot | Sustainable Seas Trust (sst.org.za)

AlgoaADZ_Pre-appBAR_AppD_MarEcol.pdf (anchorenvironmental.co.za)

AlgoaADZ_Pre-appBAR_AppD_MarEcol.pdf (anchorenvironmental.co.za)

https://www.who.int/foodsafety/fs_management/No_01_Biosecurity_Mar10_en.pdf

Gregory D. Koblentz, Biosecurity Reconsidered, Calibrating Biological Threats and Responses, 2010. Biosecurity (Reconsidered)