OPEN LETTER

To the Mayor Mr Thomas Westphal
tom.westphal@stadtdo.de
To the Second Mayor Ms Barbara Brunsing
barbara.brunsing@gruene-dortmund.de

Cc: Offices of the parties

info@cdu-fraktion-dortmund.de
fraktion@spd-fraktion-dortmund.de
c.naumann@gruene-do.de
cbehlau@stadtto.de
info@fdp-dortmund.de
info@diefraktiondortmund.de

Cc: The Board of the Westfalenhallen

Uwe Waßmann: U.Wassmann@t-online.de
Fabian Erstfeld: fabian.ernstfeld@spd-dortmund.de
Olaf Schlienkamp: rat@olafschlienkamp.de
Katharina Diwisch: diwisch@diefraktiondortmund.de
Ute Meis: umais@ute-mais.de
Jacques Armel Dsicheu Djiné: info@djine.de
Franz-Josef Rüther ruether@ags-dortmund.de
Manfred Sträter: manfred.straeter@gmail.com
Lars Vogeler: post@lars-vogeler.de

17 January 2023

Dear Thomas Westphal and Barbara Brunsing, Lord Mayor and Second Mayor of the City of Dortmund,

AN AFRICAN PERSPECTIVE ON THE NEGATIVE IMPACTS OF THE COLONIAL-STYLE COMMERCIALISATION OF ENDANGERED WILDLIFE SPECIES ADVERTISED AT ‘JAGD & HUND’ HUNTING FAIR IN DORTMUND, GERMANY

The Wildlife Animal Protection Forum South Africa (WAPFSA), supported by a number of African and International NGOs and renowned individuals and experts, express their concerns regarding trophy hunting offers at the upcoming ‘Jagd & Hund’.
WAPFSA is a community of diverse South African-based organisations that share certain values, knowledge and objectives and that collectively comprise a body of expertise from different sectors including but not limited to scientific, environmental, legal, welfare, rights, social justice, indigenous and public advocacy backgrounds.

The undersigned organisations and community representatives who are widely supported by wildlife conservationists across the African continent and beyond would like to take this opportunity to share our African perspective on the negative impacts of the commercialisation, advertisement and sale of trophy hunts of African endangered and protected species with you.

This open communication has been penned in light of the 41st annual ‘Jagd & Hund’ Hunting Show, which is advertised as Europe largest hunting exhibition to be held in Dortmund’s Westfalenhallen from the 24th January to the 29th of January 2023.

 Barely a month ago delegates at the CoP15 Biodiversity Summit, which was held in Canada, made a major conservation commitment to try to halt the loss of hundreds of thousands of plants and animals, with a hope to turn the tide on the ongoing extinction crises. The persistent removal of species through trophy hunting can have profound impacts on species extinction risk and selection within populations and can have broader negative consequences for other species and ecosystem processes.

Countries across Europe have acknowledged the fact that trophy hunting has little connection with conservation, on the 13th of December 2022 the Finnish Parliament approved a new nature conservation law that includes the banning of imports of hunting trophies from endangered species. The Finnish Nature Conservation Act will enter into force on the 1st of June 2023. In 2015 France specifically banned the import of lion trophies. In 2016 the Netherlands banned the import of hunting trophies of over 200 hundred species. In March 2022 the Belgium Parliament adopted a resolution urging the government to immediately end the authorisation of trophy import permits for certain threatened and endangered species. On the 15th of June 2022, Henry Smith MP introduced a landmark bill to Parliament to ban British hunters from bringing ‘trophies of endangered and vulnerable animals into Britain. The Hunting Trophies (Import Prohibition) Bill would be the strongest of its kind in the world and has the backing of the Government as well as from UK wildlife and animal welfare groups. A recent poll found that 86% of voters support a ban. On Friday 25th of November, the Bill passed a second reading in the House of Commons.

In sharp contradiction to the universal CoP15 December 2022 commitment to the environment, the ‘Jagd & Hund’ exhibition advertises “sport” trophy hunting, where wealthy individuals can purchase the right to hunt down and kill the biggest and strongest of animal species in Africa. These actions, we believe, undermine conservation and eco-tourism development efforts in Africa.

Dortmund is well-known as the City of Science, the motto is “One City, a Lot of Knowledge,” with seven universities, and nineteen non-university research institutes including institutions such as the Leibniz Association, the Max Plank Society, and the Fraunhofer Society.

Scientists tell us that removing male mammals from their populations can increase the risks of species extinction. By selecting the most impressive, the largest, most likely rare animal, mainly male, that is possibly
the strongest and fittest in order to become the best trophy (largest tusks and thickest manes), trophy hunters affect reproductivity weakening populations’ genetic health and variation, dislocating the surviving members of the group’s social structure, disrupting bonds and behaviours.

“Hunting Africa, Trophy Hunting, Neocolonialism and Land” is an investigative report written by Professor Sian Sullivan, in which she confirms Safari Club International World Hunting Award Field Journal dedicates more pages to Africa than any other continent. “These figures clearly show the dependence of the trophy hunting industry on securing access to Africa’s hunting grounds. Given that the hunting industry claims to African lands requires removal of African peoples and constraints on local production practices, it arguably promotes and extends colonial patterns of enclosure.”

Trophy hunting is rooted in colonial modes of extraction that perpetuate notions of abuse, subjugation, control and inequality, including gender inequality. Dr Muchazonzi Mkono’s research1 has found that trophy hunting is an objectionable consequence of a complex historical and postcolonial association. Africans have a deep resentment towards what is viewed as the neo-colonial character of trophy hunting, in the way it privileges Western elites in accessing Africa’s wildlife.

Proponents of trophy hunting argue that trophy hunting provides vast economic opportunities for local communities whereas, in truth, the economic benefits of big game hunting are wildly exaggerated and pale in comparison to the economic possibilities of eco-tourism. According to a 2013 study by Economists at Large, only 3% of the revenue generated by trophy hunting remains with local communities in Africa. In addition, hunting quotas are often set according to economic interests and market demand rather than population abundance and are not based on scientific data or standards.

In reality, trophy hunting is an elitist hobby for millionaires and billionaires who pay huge fees to kill large exotic and rare animals. Cash-strapped and corrupt governments in developing countries allow the colonialist sport to continue. According to a Report by Good Governance Africa, compared with tourism, trophy hunting provides very little benefit. The Report also questions whether the legally sanctioned killing of wild animals can be reasonably tolerated.

When there is a conflict between humans and large wildlife in Africa, this conflict is managed in fruitless ways that only have the purpose to generate revenue within the strict elite circle of the trophy hunting industry, without solving the conflict issue. Alternative, science-based, non-invasive, cost-effective methods are scraped out because of the constructed idea that trophy hunting has to be part of any conservation protocol.

Projects that offer optimal alternatives to trophy hunting, in terms of improving the livelihoods of local communities, based on regenerative, climate-resilient practices and alternative conservation activities that reject and avoid violence, subjugation and extraction in favour of more ecologically sustainable and dignifying activities do exist in countries in Africa, including Tanzania, South Africa, Namibia, Malawi, Zimbabwe, Zambia, Kenya, Uganda, Rwanda, Lesotho, Angola, Botswana, Eswatini, and Madagascar.

These practices promote fair share and equity, women and youth empowerment and self-sufficiency and focus on improving farming productivity and food security via climate-smart agricultural practices but also economic development and wildlife coexistence and resilience. We are aware that these activities struggle to flourish because of the competition with extractive, immediate-reward models and sectors which are plagued with corruption and nepotism as the hunting sector.

Most African exhibitors at the ‘Jagd & Hund’ show are from Namibia and South Africa.

In Namibia, more than 95% of trophy hunts are conducted on private land and only about 2 per cent in communal conservancies.2 Hardly any financial revenue is derived from trophy hunting in these communities.

Governments are not interested in monitoring if revenues are allocated fairly. Furthermore, many locals even feel excluded from the benefits their wildlife offers, since trophy hunting is a privilege of wealthy foreign tourists, while they themselves are mostly prohibited to hunt for subsistence. So instead of promoting economic independency and ensuring the livelihoods of local communities, trophy hunting deepens inequality and consolidates social injustice. This is a lose-lose situation, where local communities are trapped in a financially disadvantaged situation and are losing their valuable wildlife and biodiversity – which is, in turn, key for sustainable and more profitable non-consumptive alternatives.

In July 2022, in a joint position statement on Trophy Hunting, 171 animal protection organisations, including 51 NGOs from Africa, asked for trophy hunting to be banned.

A recently published survey indicated that in South Africa the opposition to trophy hunting has increased from 64% in 2020 to 68% in 2022. The survey included data sourced from a diverse South African demographic across all provinces. The key findings from the IPSOS survey include:

- 68% of South Africans fully oppose or oppose to some extent the practice of trophy hunting—an increase from 56% in a similar 2018 survey.
- 65% of South Africans fully oppose or oppose to some extent the practice of canned lion hunting—an increase from 60% in a similar 2018 survey.
- 64% of South Africans disagree with the trophy hunting of elephants, rhinos, and leopards.
- 63% of South Africans disagree with the trophy hunting of lions.
- 66% of South Africans disagree with the trophy hunting of hippos.
- 60% of South Africans disagree with the trophy hunting of giraffes.
- Regarding the 2022 hunting and export quotas announced by the Department of Forestry, Fisheries and the Environment (DFFE) in February 2022, 63% oppose the quota for 150 elephants, 62% oppose the quota for 10 black rhinos, and 61% oppose the quota for 10 leopards.

World Animal Protection recently commissioned research into public attitudes towards trophy hunting, surveying 10,900 people from around the world, including international tourists from countries who most frequently visit Africa. The research confirmed that international tourists want to see wildlife-friendly experiences and an end to trophy hunting. Tourists want to see wildlife alive and thriving and protected in a humane and ethical manner.

A study by the World Travel & Tourism Council confirmed that wildlife is worth more alive than dead. Another study of eight African countries by economists concluded that overall, tourism which relies heavily on wildlife contributed between 2.8% and 5.1% of GDP, and foreign trophy hunters made up less than 0.03% of the same GDP on average. Similarly, photo safaris, in comparison, allowed for sustainable, lucrative tourism activities without killing wildlife.

The International Union for the Conservation of Nature Ethics Specialist Group wrote to the German government to ask for an end to the practice of trophy hunting imports for ethical, ecological and legal reasons. Professor Klaus Bosselmann, chair of the aforementioned group, said: “Trophy hunting unnecessarily threatens the survival and genetic integrity of protected species in the midst of the current crisis of the sixth mass species extinction. It is overdue that Germany, as the largest importer of hunting trophies in the EU, takes action.” Members of WAPFSA congratulate the German Ministry of the Environment, Steffi Lemke’s, announcement of their intention to restrict the import of hunting trophies from protected species in Germany.

WAPFSA also welcomed the announcement by IEG Italian Exhibition Group SpA in 2022 to discontinue Italy’s largest hunting fair in Vincenza in light of the fact that the event was incompatible with environmental values.

The Members of WAPFSA graciously urge you, in your esteemed position, to acknowledge our perspective and to consider, at the very least, the suspension of the advertisement, promotion and sale of trophy hunts of African endangered and protected species at the ‘Jagd & Hund’ event.

Yours faithfully,

stefania falcon
stefania@wapfsa.org
Mobile: +27 (0)73 3012107
ON BEHALF OF WAPFSA
http://wapfsa.org/

SIGNING MEMBERS OF THE WILDLIFE ANIMAL PROTECTION FORUM SOUTH AFRICA:

Lex Abnett - Director, Southern African Fight for Rhinos, South Africa
Renee Bish - Co-Founder, Bettys Bay Baboon Action Group, South Africa
Peter Oxford - Co-Founder, Betty’s Bay Baboon Action Group, South Africa
Toni Brockhoven - Chairperson, Beauty Without Cruelty, South Africa
Megan Carr – Founder of Rhinos in Africa
Lizaene Cornwall - Co-Founder Panthera Africa Big Cat Sanctuary, South Africa
Chief Stephen Fritz - Indigenous Leader, South Peninsula Khoi Council, South Africa
Dr Smaragda Louw – Director of Ban Animal Trading, South Africa
Fiona Miles, Director of Four Paws South Africa
Catherine Nyquist - Co-Founder Panthera Africa Big Cat Sanctuary, South Africa
Dave Du Toit - Founder, Vervet Monkey Foundation, South Africa
Stefania Falcon - Co-Founder, Future 4 Wildlife, South Africa
Sera Farista - Climate Justice Youth Climate Group, South Africa
Sairusha Govindsamy - Climate Policies, African Climate Alliance, South Africa
Guy Jenning - Director, WildAid, Southern Africa
Vivien Law - Regenerative Farming Project, Parliament for the People, South Africa
Les Mitchell - Director, Institute for Critical Animal Studies, Africa
Jabu Myeni - Environmental Education Programme, Gifted for Good, South Africa
Stephen Munro - Director, Centre for Animal Rehabilitation and Education, South Africa
Michele Pickover, Executive Director of the EMS Foundation
Steve Smit - Co-Founder, Monkey Helpline, Rehabilitation Centre, South Africa
Linda Tucker - CEO Founder of the Global White Lion Protection Trust
Wynter Worsthorne - Founder, Animal Talk Africa, South Africa

SIGNED BY THE FOLLOWING MEMBERS OF THE PRO ELEPHANT NETWORK:

Owais Awan - Advocate in the High Court, Islamabad, Pakistan
Suparna Baksi-Ganguly - President /Co-Founder, Wildlife Rescue & Rehabilitation Center, India
Dr Brett Bard - Wildlife Veterinarian, South Africa
Dr Jessica Bell Rizzolo - Postdoctoral Researcher, Michigan State University, USA
Lenin Chisaira - Founder, Advocates 4 Earth / Green Law Connect, Zimbabwe
Janey Clegg - Committee Member, SPCA Mutare, Zimbabwe
Dr Betsy Coville - Exotic and Wildlife Animal Veterinarian, USA
Dr Harvey Croze - Co-Founder, Amboseli Elephant Research Project, Kenya
Nomusa Dube - Founder, Zimbabwe Elephant Foundation, United Kingdom
David Ebert - Founder and Director, Animal Defense Partnership, USA
Michele Franko - Captive Elephant Caregiver and Wildlife Advocate, USA
Dr Toni Frohoff- Ethologist, Behavioral Biologist, Founder of TerraMar Research, USA
Dr Marion E. Garai - Elephant Behaviour Specialist, South Africa
Dr Ross Harvey - Environmental Economist, Botswana
Iris Ho - Head of Policy Pan African Sanctuary Alliance (PASA), USA
Sangita Iyer - Founder, Voice for Asian Elephants Society, Nat Geo Explorer, Filmmaker, Canada
David Kabambo - Founder and Director of Peace for Conservation, Wildlife Management, Tanzania
Dr Paula Kahumbu - Chief Executive Officer WildlifeDirect, Kenya
Professor Mohan Kharel - Tribhuvan University, Kathmandu, Nepal
Nuria Maldonado – Co-Founder, Int. Species Conservation and Animal Protection Expert Service, Spain
Duncan McNair – CEO, Save The Asian Elephants, United Kingdom
Jim Karani – Director, Lawyers for Animal Protection in Africa, Kenya
Dr Winnie Kiiru - Founder, Conservation Kenya, Kenya
Brigitte Kornetzky - President and Founder, Elefanten in Not, Switzerland / India
Professor Bob Jacobs - Psychology Department, Colorado College, USA
Lynne James - Consultant, Elephant Conservation, Zimbabwe
Dr Mark Jones - Veterinarian & Head of Policy, Born Free Foundation, UK
Kahindi Lekalhaile - Africa Network for Animal Welfare, Kenya
Linda Masudze - Lawyer, Advocate 4 Earth, Zimbabwe
Varda Mehrotra- Co-Founder, Samayu, A Just World, India
Dr Cynthia Moss - Director, Amboseli Trust for Elephants, Kenya
Dr Nurzhafraina Binti Othman- Founder, Seratu Aatai, Elephant Conservation and Research, Malaysia
Tina Papadopolou - Co-Founder, Free Bunka Organisation, UK
Sharon Pincott - Elephant Behavioral Specialist, ex-Hwange, Zimbabwe
Bharati Ramachandran - CEO of the Federation of Indian Animal Protection Organizations, India
Ian Redmond OBE - Co-Founder, Rebalance Earth, Chairman Ape Alliance, UK
Ingo Schmiding - Co-Founder, Int. Species Conservation and Animal Protection Expert Service, Germany
Dr Jan Schmidt-Burbach - Head of Wildlife and Animal Welfare, World Animal Protection Int, Germany
Dr DJ Schubert - Wildlife Biologist, Animal Welfare Institute, USA
Mark Stratton - Co-Founder, Free Bunka Organisation, Environmental Journalist, UK
Dr Liz Tyson - Animal Welfare Law, Programs Director, Born Free, USA
Antoinette Van de Water - Director, Bring the Elephant Home, South Africa
Vasanthi Vadi - Trustee of the Federation of Indian Animal Protection Organizations, India
Professor Dan Wylie - Poet, Author, Rhodes University, South Africa

ENDORSED BY:

Henry Smith – Member of Parliament for Crawley, United Kingdom
Will Travers OBE - Co-Founder and Executive President, Born Free Foundation, United Kingdom
Damian Aspinall – Chairman, Aspinall Foundation, United Kingdom
John Read, International Director, Campaign to Ban Trophy Hunting, United Kingdom
Jay Naidoo – Former Minister for the Reconstruction and Development Programme during the Nelson Mandela Presidency, South Africa
Professor David Bilchitz – Professor of Fundamental Rights and Constitutional Law, South Africa
Dr Gay Bradshaw – Psychologist and Ecologist, Founder and Director, Kerulos Centre for Nonviolence, USA
Professor Phyllis Lee - Director of Science, Amboseli Trust for Elephants
Dr Richard Ssuna – Wildlife Veterinarian, Founder All Creatures Trust, Uganda
Valentina Bagnato - Head, International Relations, International Organisation for Animal Protection, Italy
Nathan Edward Swartz - Head Researcher, IKSHA COUNCIL, South Africa
Timothy Kamuzu Phiri - Executive Director and Co-Founder, Mizu Eco Care Organisation, Zambia
Yannick Ndoinyo, Executive Director, Traditional Ecosystems Survival Tanzania
Alfred Sihwa, Director of Sibanye Animal Welfare & Conservancy Trust, Zimbabwe
Charles Simane - Researcher, Climate Justice Charter Movement, South Africa
Craig Spencer - Founder CEO, Transfrontier Africa NPC and Black Mambas Anti-Poaching Unit, South Africa
Karl Ammann - Wildlife Photographer & Conservation Documentary Film Producer, Switzerland
Jared Kukura - Conservation Writer, WildThings Initiative, USA
Elisabetta Corra - Environmental Author, Founder, Tracking Extinction, Italy
Charan Saunders - Environmental Consultant, South Africa
Margo Naude - Head of Communications, Global White Lion Protection Trust, South Africa
Francis Garrard – Director, Conservation Action Trust, South Africa
Stephen A Wiggins – Founder, International Wildlife Bond, United Kingdom
Cormac Cullinan, Director of the Wild Law Institute